



ICC Evaluation Service, Inc.  
Los Angeles Business/Regional Office  
5360 Workman Mill Road  
Whittier, CA 90601  
tel: 562.699.0543  
fax: 562.695.4694  
www.icc-es.org

**To:** ICC-ES Evaluation Committee  
**From:** David Pereg, P.E.  
**Date:** January 29, 2008  
**Subject:** Proposed Acceptance Criteria for Narrow-gap Improved  
Electroslag Welding (NGI-ESW), Subject AC411-0209-R1  
(DP/BG)

**MEMO**

In response to the subject proposed acceptance criteria, ICC-ES has received an e-mail from Praful Patel of Smith-Emery Laboratories, dated January 23, 2009. Based on that e-mail, and subsequent conversations with Smith-Emery, it is understood that further discussions are needed with the applicant to define the scope of the product and/or process whose recognition is being sought by the report applicant, and the scope of what ICC-ES can reference in the proposed acceptance criteria and subsequent evaluation report. In addition to defining the scope for purposes of enabling ICC-ES to review any technical issues, staff has concerns about keeping the scope of the acceptance criteria and subsequent evaluation report within a defined boundary that will enable the applicant and ICC-ES to be involved enough in any processes to ensure that they are properly performed and that resulting product(s) comply with the requirements set forth within the evaluation report. Such discussions will enable refinement of the scope and requirements of the proposed acceptance criteria, and the presentation of a revised acceptance criteria for Evaluation Committee consideration at a later date.

Staff welcomes input from the Evaluation Committee, as well as other interested parties, as to the practice of approving proprietary welding processes, with proprietary weld-metal, that are based on qualified Welding Process Specifications (WPSs) and Procedure Qualification Records (PQRs). Additionally, comments are requested about the practice of approving structural designs based on proprietary welding processes.